

SCHEDULE "B" TO THE AGENDA FOR THE
WESTERN PLANNING COMMITTEE
25 NOVEMBER 2009

Applications not subject to public speaking.

Background Papers (DoP&D)

Background papers (as defined by Section 100D(5) of the Local Government Act 1972) relating to this report are listed under the "Representations" heading for each planning application presented, or may be individually identified under a heading "Background Papers".

The implications for crime, disorder and community safety have been appraised in the following applications, but it is not considered that any consideration of that type arises unless it is specifically referred to in a particular report.

B1	WA/2009/1323 J Clare 30/09/2009	<u>Erection of replacement dwelling and garage (as amended by plans received 30/09/2009 and as amplified by letter and plans received 8.10.09) at Temple Hill, High Thicket Road, Dockenfield, Farnham, GU10 4HE</u>
----	---------------------------------------	--

Grid Reference:	E: 481873 N: 139928
-----------------	------------------------

Parish :	Dockenfield
Ward :	Frensham, Dockenfield and Tilford
Case Officer:	Ms L Smitheman

8 Week Expiry Date	25/11/2009
--------------------	------------

Neighbour Notification Expiry Date	16/10/2009
------------------------------------	------------

Neighbour Notification	30/10/2009
------------------------	------------

Amended/Additional Expiry Date	
--------------------------------	--

RECOMMENDATION	That planning permission be GRANTED
----------------	--

This application has been brought before the Area Committee at the request of the local ward member

Location or Layout Plan



Site Description

The site is located in a rural woodland setting. The area is characterised by large detached dwellings on generous plots, woodland and paddock. It is in close proximity to Alice Holt forest. The majority of properties in the immediate area are based on the prevailing Surrey vernacular with plain tile roofs, clay tile hanging, light render and red bricks. Four Winds (the adjacent property) reflects this character.

A nearby public footpath runs in close proximity to the east boundary of the site. There is good screening from much of the footpath.

The site is approached from High Thicket Road with a driveway leading through a short stretch of woodland to a clearing where the existing house stands. The site slopes down to the south and east

The existing dwelling is an unusual barn style building with dark timber boarding and an interesting roof form and slate roof. The upper storeys are “in the roof”.

Proposal

The applicants propose a contemporary designed replacement two storey dwelling and garage. The proposal would measure 319.5sqm above ground with a basement area of 50sqm. A garage measuring 55sqm is also proposed.

Relevant Planning History

WA/2008/0382	Erection of a replacement dwelling together with a detached garage following demolition of existing dwelling (revision of WA/2007/0385).	Full Permission 17/04/2008
WA/2007/0385	Erection of replacement dwelling together with a detached garage following demolition of existing dwelling.	Refused 19/04/2007 Appeal Dismissed 08/11/2007
WA/2006/1546	Construction of a new shared access drive and fence.	Invalid 03/11/2006
WA/2005/2504	Change of use from a conference centre and retreat to 2 independent dwellings.	Full Permission 21/04/2006
WA/1998/0810	Erection of outbuilding.	Full Permission 17/07/1998
WA/1995/1674	Variation of Condition 1 of WA90/1915 (temporary permission) to allow the permanent use of premises as a retreat and conference centre.	Full Permission 07/02/1996
WA/1990/1915	Continued use of premises as a retreat and training centre (as amplified and amended by letters dated 04/02/91, 07/02/91 and 14/02/91 and plans received 08/02/91).	Temporary Permission 08/03/1991
WA/1986/0472	Use of house, barn cottage and grounds as Religious Training Centre.	Temporary Permission 02/09/1986
WA77/0106	Use as Religious Training Centre on a permanent basis.	Refused 05/04/1977
WA76/1706	Retention of house and grounds as a religious training centre as previously granted under Planning Reference HM/R22319 (Renewal).	Full Permission 07/03/1979
HM/R22319	Retention of use of house and grounds as religious training centre	Approve 09/01/1974

Planning Policy Constraints

Countryside beyond Green Belt – outside any settlement
Wealden Heaths I SPA 5km
East Hants SPA 5km
SPAD
AGLV

Development Plan Policies and Proposals

Policies D1, D4, D7, C2, C3, RD2A of the Waverley Borough Local Plan 2002
Policies CC6 of the South East Plan 2009

Consultations and Town/Parish Council Comments

Dockenfield Parish Council object.

Concerns: Impact on the countryside; drainage; preservation orders on trees; must close entrance to Four Winds; policy on increase in footprint (?50%).

Impact on the countryside: The rebuild is not in keeping. Collage of materials displayed are from properties in Frensham not Dockenfield. Policy SE4 “sense of place” is infringed.

Drainage: This should be sited in such position so that the outflow should not pollute either the public footpath or neighbouring properties with residual or overflow water from drains and surface water disposal. Where does the outfall go? On someone else’s land? Given the past history of outflow onto the adjacent footpath and the recent history of a badly installed new drainage system for the Four Winds site affecting an adjacent property we are unconvinced that the proposed outflow design and calculations will not result in flooding of land in adjacent ownerships when combined with the surface water drainage.

Replacement dwelling: Replacement dwelling policy states that the proposed increase should be no more than 10% of existing dwelling This plan appears to show approaching a 50% increase overall.

Therefore the Parish Council OBJECTS to this application on grounds of size of building proposed and severe change in character. The original condition of physically closing the Four Winds entrance has not been complied with and should be a set condition before granting any further permission.

County Highway Authority: No objection

Environment Agency: Not yet received. An update will be reported to Committee.

Environmental Health: The plans demonstrate an adequate system which is taking into account natural features to ensure adequate discharge away from existing structures. Given the details provided for this system it is unnecessary to impose a condition. However the applicant is advised to consider

appropriate additional measures for uptake of any discharged water due to the soil type in this area.

Building Control: The porosity tests have been taken and the correct design formula used. The full extent of the soakaway should be shown on the site plan so that it is clear where this will start and finish. From a practical point of view the existing fruit trees may make excavating this trench difficult.

Representations

2 objections have been received based on the following grounds:

- Design – siting. The proposed replacement dwelling is sited significantly forward of the existing dwelling to the detriment of the visual amenity at Four Winds. The garage also creates an expanse of development together with the proposed dwelling immediately along the boundary which currently is not there
- Design – siting results in loss of trees to development. The trees provide valuable screening between the development and Four Winds
- Design – materials and finishing should be of a very high standard and detailed
- Design – out of keeping with the surrounding area
- Design scale – overdevelopment
- Impact on the countryside - overdevelopment
- Sewerage and drainage – the proposed sewage treatment plant is not suitable for heavy soil
- Landscaping – a condition is required as to the planting frequency, species position and size of a hedge boundary

Determining Issues

- Extant permission under WA2008/0382
- Impact on the countryside
- Design acceptability
- Sewerage and drainage
- Renewable Energy

Planning Considerations

- Extant permission

The permission granted under WA/2008/0382 is a highly material consideration in the assessment of the current application. The dimensions of that permission are included in the table below.

- Impact on the countryside

The site is located within the Countryside beyond the Green Belt outside of any settlement. Proposals for replacement dwellings are subject to Policy RD2A of the Local Plan. This states that:

Outside settlements, proposals for the replacement of dwelling will be permitted provided that the replacement dwelling

- (a) is not materially larger than the dwelling it replaces. (The text to policy RD2A indicates that proposals should not exceed a guideline of 10% greater in floor area than the dwelling it replaces)
- (b) is of an appropriate design which reflects the local distinctiveness of the area
- (c) will not appear more intrusive in the landscape or otherwise detract from the rural character of the area

In assessing whether the replacement building is materially larger, the existing building and proposal have been compared

Sqm	Proposed	Existing	Approved under WA/2008/0382
2 nd floor	0	14.5	0
1 st floor	137.5	138	120
Ground floor	182	235.5	179
Basement	50	0	36
Totals	369.5	388	335

	Proposed	Existing	Approved under WA/2008/0382
Ridge height - datum	122.1 (main part of building)	125.27 (highest) 123.97 (lowest)	123.97
Eaves height - datum	121.6 (main part of building)	120 average	119.2 (north elevation) 120.45 (south elevation)

In addition a garage measuring 55sqm is proposed.

The proposal would result in an increase of –4.8 % over the existing dwelling including the basement area. However given that the basement would not be visible above ground level, it is considered appropriate to exclude it from the calculation. Excluding the basement the proposal would result in a 17.7% reduction in floor area.

The ridge and eaves levels have been related back to the existing building. The proposed building ridge is 1.87m lower than the existing building ridge (3.17m lower than the existing building tower). The eaves height of the proposed building is 1.6m higher than the existing eave.

Overall, based on the figures above, it is not considered that the proposal is materially larger than that existing.

Design acceptability

-Design siting. The siting is as far forward as that already approved. The distance to Four Winds is such that it is not considered that there is an adverse impact on visual amenity to that property although it is visible.

-Design bulk and massing and height and overdevelopment

The split level makes efficient use of the space whilst reducing the height of the building.

The scale, bulk and mass would be significantly less than the existing dwelling due to the contemporary design. This is not considered to be an overdevelopment of the site.

-Design and local distinctiveness

Given the relatively isolated location of Temple Hill and that it is already distinctly different from the prevailing building form there is acceptance in principle of replacing the dwelling with a more contemporary structure. Its relative isolation, the scale of the existing plot and the relationship to Four Winds support the approach of doing something different. In addition PPS1 explains that "LPAs should not attempt to impose architectural styles or particular tastes and they should not stifle innovation, originality or initiative through unsubstantiated requirements to conform to certain development forms or styles. It is however proper to seek to promote or reinforce local distinctiveness particularly where this is by clear plan policies or SPD"

In this instance there is a clear opportunity to do something different that is innovative and original but it must be of high quality and have no detrimental impact on the character of the area/AGLV.

It is a matter of judgement for members but it is considered that the design style albeit in a striking modern design is distinctive and contributes to architectural variety in the area.

-Design and materials

The use of timber cladding and red brick on the proposed scheme would provide strong visual link to the prevailing use of materials. Although it would be preferable to see a darker timber used to reflect the existing building and provide a historical point of context and the red brick appears rather institutional on plan, materials can be made subject to planning condition.

-Design and loss of trees

The siting would also not result in the loss of any significant trees. A landscaping scheme would be sought in any conditions.

- Sewerage and Drainage

The concerns of the Parish Council and neighbours in respect of drainage have been carefully noted.

The applicants state a specialist drainage firm has been employed to carry out a trial pit, percolation test and to put forward recommendations for a foul drainage scheme. On the basis of that report it is intended to provide the proposed house with an independent small treatment plant, this providing both primary and secondary treatment. The treated output would be discharged to a soakaway. The natural lie of the land (slope) and large site area is conducive to an effective soakaway, these benefits offsetting the limitations of the clay subsoil. It is notable that the nearby house Penns Grove would be very unlikely to be affected in any way by these drainage proposals as the natural lie of the land is such that surface water would be carried away from that house.

The above submissions by the applicant are considered to be acceptable. Waverley's Environmental Health and Building Control sections have not indicated any significant concerns.

The planning test is whether the proposal can be effectively connected to infrastructure to avoid consequences for pollution or flooding. The proposals are considered acceptable in principle. The detailed operation of the provision are matters for building control.

- Renewable Energy

The dwelling has been designed to make use of natural daylighting and to benefit from its solar orientation. The 10% target for renewable energy contribution would be achieved by installing a ground (geo thermal) heat pump. A further contribution to the renewable energy target will be provided by a woodburning stove in the dwelling.

- Access

An approved access has been implemented. The County Highway Authority has no objections.

- Other representations

The strong concerns of the Parish Council and neighbours have largely been addressed by the above considerations

Conclusion

The proposal meets the criteria for a replacement dwelling in the countryside, the design of the development is considered to be acceptable, subject to conditions. Sewerage and foul drainage issues have been satisfactorily addressed. Renewable energy is proposed to meet 10% targets. Overall the

development is considered to be acceptable subject to the appropriate conditions.

Recommendation

That permission be **GRANTED** subject to the following conditions:

1. Condition
No development shall take place until details of the external materials to be utilized in the construction of the development hereby permitted, have been submitted to and approved, in writing, by the Local Planning Authority. The development shall be carried to in accordance with the approved details.

Reason

In order to protect the character and amenity of the area and to accord with Policies D1, D4, RD2A of the Waverley Borough Local Plan 2002.

2. Condition
Before any work on site begins, cross sections/details indicating the proposed finished ground levels surrounding the building shall be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The works shall be carried out in strict accordance with the approved details

Reason

In order to protect the character and amenity of the area and to accord with Policies D1, D4, RD2A of the Waverley Borough Local Plan 2002

3. Condition
No development shall take place until a detailed landscaping scheme, including hedging, has been submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority in writing. The landscaping scheme shall be carried out strictly in accordance with the agreed details and shall be carried out within the first planting season after commencement of the development or as otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority. The landscaping shall be maintained to the satisfaction of the Local Planning Authority for a period of 5 years after planting, such maintenance to include the replacement of any trees and shrubs that die or have otherwise become, in the opinion of the Local Planning Authority, seriously damaged or defective. Such replacements to be of same species and size as those originally planted.

Reason

In order to protect the character and amenity of the area and to accord with Policies D1, D4 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan 2002.

4. Condition
The proposed ground source heat pump as shown on the approved plans shall be installed and become operational upon the first occupation of the development and thereafter be retained and maintained unless otherwise agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason

To maintain and enhance the quality of the environment and to comply with Policy D3 of the Waverley Borough Local Plan 2002

5. Condition
The plan numbers to which this permission relates are
Drawing NO. 02 revision A.
Drawing No 01 revision A
Drawing No 08
Drawing No 07
Drawing No 06
Drawing No 05
Drawing No 04
Drawing NO 03
Drawing No 09
Drawing No 10
Drawing No 11
Drawing No 12
Drawing No 13

The development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans. No material variation from these plans shall take place unless otherwise first agreed in writing with the Local Planning Authority.

Reason

In order to protect the character and amenity of the area and to accord with Policies D1, D4, RD2A of the Waverley Borough Local Plan 2002.

Informatives

On 6 April 2008 a new fee was introduced by the Town and Country Planning (Fees of Applications and Deemed Applications) (Amendment) (England) Regulations 2008. This fee relates to requests to discharge a condition on a planning consent. The fee payable is £85.00 or a reduced rate of £25.00 for household applications. The fee is charged per written request not per condition to be discharged. A Conditions Discharge form is available and can be downloaded from our web site.

Please note that the fee is refundable if the Local Planning Authority concerned has failed to discharge the condition by 12 weeks after receipt of the required information.

"IMPORTANT" This planning permission contains certain conditions precedent that state 'before development commences' or 'prior to commencement of any development' (or similar). As a result these must be discharged prior to ANY development activity taking place on site. Commencement of development without having complied with these conditions will make any development unauthorised and possibly subject to enforcement action such as a Stop Notice. If the conditions have not been subsequently satisfactorily discharged within the time allowed to implement the permission then the development will remain unauthorised.

* * * * *

Comms/Area Planning Committee (Western)/ 002 Schedule B – 25.11.09

58904